ABRAMSON & DENENBERG, P.C.

Attorneys-at-Law

Simon J Denenberg*
Thomas Bruno. II*
David H. Denenberg*
Alan E. Denenberg*
D Ben van Steenburgh*
* Member PA Bar

Member NJ Bar

... Member DC Bar

Twelfth Floor 1315 Walnut Street Philadelphia, PA 19107 e-mail; lawyers@adlawfirm com Fax: (215) 546-5355

(215) 546-1345

A Pennsylvania Corporation

registered in New Jersey (856) 354-9385
Benjamin Abranison 1932 - 1978
Of Counsel
Aileen Schwartz**
Feri B. Himebaugh*

October 28, 2010

James Heenehan, Sr., Esquire Assistant Regional Counsel Office of Regional Counsel 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2029

> Re: In the Matter of: Regina Bennett Docket No. TSCA-03-2010-0407

Dear Mr. Heenehan:

I represent Regina Bennett in the above captioned matter. Enclosed please find a copy of Respondent's Answer to the above referenced Complaint, which was also served via hand delivery.

On behalf of my client, I am formally requesting a hearing on this matter, and also a Settlement Conference.

I look forward to hearing from you regarding the scheduling of both the hearing and the Settlement Conference.

David Deficibers

DHD/sdv Encls.

Cc: Regina Bennett

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION III

In the Matter of:

v.

Regina Bennett 1496 Coralberry Court

amison, Pennsylvania

RESPONDENT

Rhiladelphia, PA 19126

TARGET HOUSING

U.S. EPA Docket No.

TSCA-03-2010-0407

RESPONDENT'S ANSWER TO ADMINISTRATIVE

COMPLAINT AND REQUEST

FOR A HEARING

Respondent, Regina Bennett, by and through her attorney, David Denenberg, Esquire, hereby Answers the Administrative Complaint regarding target housing located at 6516 North 7th Street and requests a hearing and in support thereof avers as follows:

- 1. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 2. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 3. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 4. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 5. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 6. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 7. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 8. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 9. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 10. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.

- 11. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 12. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 13. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 14. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 15. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 16. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 17. Admitted.
- 18. Ádmitted.
- 19. Admitted.
- 20. No response necessary.
- 21. Admitted.
- 22. Admitted. By way of further response, at the time Respondent leased the North 7th Street Lease Target Housing Property on March 5, 2008, she was unaware that it contained lead paint and was unaware that it was a "target property" that was regulated cursuant to a Federal Statute. Accordingly, Respondent, a local property owner, was unaware of the requirements of the Federal Statute regarding disclosure. The Respondent has never been cited before for violating the Federal Law and did not consciously or diagrantly violate the Federal Law in this circumstance. Moreover, as soon as the Respondent became aware of the Federal requirements, she brought herself in compliance with them regarding any covered rental properties that she owns. Exhibit "E", Disclosure forms.
 - 23. Admitted.

- 24. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.

 By way of further response, the Respondent was unaware that it was "target housing."
- 25. Admitted. By way of further response, at the time the Respondent leased the house on March 5, 2008, she was unaware of any lead paint problems in the leasehold. When the Respondent was cited for lead paint violations by the City of hiladelphia on October 6, 2008, she took immediate action to remedy the problem.

 Exhibit "A", October 6, 2008 Letter from City. Specifically, the Respondent hired a contractor for \$3,329.25 to remedy the problem, and by October 28, 2008, the lead paint problem was remedied. Exhibit "B", Estimate from Contractor; Exhibit "C", October 28, 2008 Letter from City; Exhibit "D", October 31, 2008 Letter from City.
 - 26. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
 - 27. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
 - 28. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
 - 29. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 30. Paragraphs 1 through 29 are hereby incorporated by reference as if more fully set-forth herein.
- 31. Admitted. By way of further response, as soon as Respondent became aware of the Federal Requirement, she provided the required hazard information pamphlet and continues to comply with the requirement. Exhibit "E".
- 32. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.

 By way of further response, as alleged above, the Respondent has a number of mitigating facts or circumstances. She was unaware of the Federal Requirement, and did not consciously or flagrantly fail to provide the pamphlet, once she learned of the lead paint,

- 33. Paragraphs 1 through 32 are hereby incorporated by reference as if more fully set-forth herein.
- 34. Admitted. By way of further response, as soon as Respondent became aware of the Federal Requirement, she provided the required information in all leases and continues to comply with the requirement.
 - 35. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.
- 36. Paragraphs 1 through 35 are hereby incorporated by reference as if more mally set-forth herein.
- 37. Admitted. By way of further response, as soon as Respondent became aware of the Federal Requirement, she provided the required information in all leases and continues to comply with the requirement.
 - 38. Conclusion and/or Statement of Law to which no response is necessary.

PROPOSED CIVIL LIABILITY

Before the instant action, Respondent had never been cited for violating the Toxic Substances Control Act, nor did she flagrantly violate it in this circumstance. In addition, Respondent is now in compliance with the letter of Act, and has provided all of her lessees the required disclosures. Respondent has also taken proactive measures to eliminate any lead paint problems in her rental units.

NOTICE OF REQUEST FOR A HEARING

Respondent hereby requests a hearing on this matter.

SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE

Respondent hereby requests a Settlement Conference on this matter.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,

DAVID DENENBERG, ESQUIRE ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT 1315 Walnut St., 12th Floor Philadelphia, Pa 19107 215-546-1345

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, David Denenberg, Esquire, hereby certify that on October 28, 2010, I served a true and correct copy of Respondents' Answer to the Administrative Complaint, Docket No. TSCA-03-2010-0407, via hand delivery and First Class Mail, postage prepaid, on the following:

James Heenehan, Sr., Esquire Assistant Regional Counsel Office of Regional Counsel 1550 Arch Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2029

Date: October 28, 2010

DAVID DENENBERG, ESQUIRE



CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

PHILADELPHIA DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALT Municipal Services Bldg. 16th & IFK Blvd Phile Pa.

Donald Swartz. Health Commissioner

October 6, 2008

Re; 6516 N. 7th St., Apt#2

Mr. Justin Bronzell/Ms. Lockett 6516 N. 7th St Phila. Ps. 19120

The owner of this property contends that she has made attempts to reduce the lead-paint azards in the above referenced property. He notes that he has contacted you advising you that you and your family can not be present while the work is being done. If you are found to be uncooperative by not allowing this work to get done, I will remove this property from the non-compliance list by indicating "uncooperative". That will allow the owner to take you to "Landlord-Tenant Court" for an eviction order. You will have ten days from the date of this letter to respond. You can reach me by telephone at 215-685-2364.

oseph B. Kauffman

Program Manager of Inspections and Enforcement



6516 N. 7th Street

Philadelphia, Pa

After inspecting and measuring the work requested on the Lead Hazard Control Worksheet you provided, I used the Lead Hazard Control Component Price List provided to me by the Philadelphia Dept. of Public Health to provide this price proposal.

In addition to the work, a super cleaning is also required to ensure dust wipe clearance. This procedure consists of top down wash clean and heap-vacuuming of the entire premise. The cost of this is \$350.00 per unit floor.

This also includes a PA State Notification, with job I.D. number, and all licensed and registered employees documented. I also coordinate Quality Control and Final Inspections, and guarantee you will receive the compliance letter you require.

I understand that these cases are usually sudden and unexpected to the landlord, and offer a case by case discount bases on the condition of the property.

PROPOSAL 1: The worksheet recommends (P)-remove loose paint, stabilize with primer and approved paint coating. The total work sheet price would be \$6,293.00. I separated each work area as follows:

(a) EXTERIOR PAINT \$1,183.30

less 40% discount (-\$709.95)

(b) INTERIOR PAINT \$4,759.70

less 40% discount (-\$1,903.80)

(c) SUPER CLEAN

\$350.00

less 100% discount (-350.00)

TOTAL

\$6,293.00

LESS

\$2,963.75= \$3,329.25

\$

This is an agreement totaling \$3,329.25 for all proposed work as indicated on the Lead Hazard Control Worksheet. We can start at your earliest convenience.

Than kyour

VINCENT J. HOGAN, PRESIDENT

EXHIBIT

B"



CITYOF PHILADELPHIA

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH CHILDHOOD LEAD POISONING PREVENTION PROGRAM PNH. BUILDING #3 2100 West Girard Avenue Philadelphia, PA 19130-1400

Donald F. Schwarz, MD, MPH Deouty Meyor for Health & Opportunity

10/29/2008

Regina Bennett

PO Box 2341

Warminster, PA. 18974

re: 6516 N 7th St 2

Dear Owner / Agont:

The Health Department issued an order for the removal of lead hazards at the above property on 10/06/2008 A re-inspection of the property on 10/28/2008 shows that the removal work has been completed, and the areas repainted.

At this inspection, dust wipes were taken for your clearance test. We are awaiting the laboratory results of these samples. You will be notitifed of the test results. If you do not pass the clearance test, you will be given further instructions.

If you have any questions, call #(215) 685-2328, 2329, or 2330 Monday through Friday, 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.

Sincerely,

Juph B. Kauffman

Joseph B. Kauffman Inspection and Enforcement Program Manager





CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH CHILDHOOD LEAD FO SIONING PREVENTION PROGRAM NIN, BUILDING #3 2100 West Griefo Avenue Philadolphia FA 19130-1400

Denald F. Schwarz, MD, MPH Deputy Mayor for Health & Coportinity

10/31/2008

Regina Bennett

P.O. Box 2341

Warminster, PA. 18974

Te-6516 N 7th St 2

Dear Owner / Agent

The Health Department issued an order for the removal of lead hazards at the above property on 10/06/2008. A re-inspection of the property on 10/28/2008 shows that the removal work has been completed.

This property is in compliance with the Philadelphia Lead Based Paint Regulations.

If you have a scheduled court appearance date for Lead Court, and you have received this letter, you do not have to appear for that scheduled court date. You will receive, by mail, a copy of the court order confirming that this case has been discontinued and ended.

Because all of the lead paint has not been completely removed, you must continue to watch the property for lead hazards (deteriorated paint) and take corrective action as needed in the future

If you have any questions, call #(215) 685-2788, Monday through Friday, 8:30 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.

Sincerely,

Joseph B. Kauffman

Inspection and Enforcement Program Manager



10/25,	(2018 1	7:20 18	663 9 45883	. 1TN1TH	
					PAGE 01/0:
Dan - Jako A		1.516	(Disclosure F	orm for Rentals and Leases	(3)
Ргорену А	aaress: _	0010	(Include U	nit # if multi-unit building)	<u> </u>
Disclos	ure of I	nformati	on on Lead-E	Based Paint and/	or Lead-Based Paint Hazards
pose health pregnant w	using buil n hazards nomen. E t-based p	t before 197 s if not mana sefore rentir paint hazard	aged properly. Le ig pre-1978 housii	ad exposure is especia ng, lessors must disclo	from paint, paint chips, and dust can ally harmful to young children and use the presence of lead-based paint beive a federally approved pamphlet on
Lessor's E			sed paint and/or l	i ead-based paint hazar	ds (Check (i) or (ii) below):
	(i) <u> </u>	Known le (explain)	•	nd/or lead-based paint	hazards are present in the housing
	(ii)	housing.	,	·	d/or lead-based paint hazards in the
(b) Retords and reports available to the lessor (Check (i) or (ii) below): (i) Lessor has provided the lessee with all available records and reports pertaining to lead-based paint and/or lead-based paint hazards in the housing (List documents below).					
Lead PAINT ABATEMENT COMPLETED OCTOBER 200					rad OCTOBER 2008,
	(ii)	_	as no reports or re in the housing.	ecords pertaining to lea	ad-based paint and/or lead-based paint
Lessee's	1	edgment (l ee has reco	•	information listed abov	/e.
(d) DS	Less	ee has rece	eived the pamphle	t <i>Protect Your Family i</i>	from Lead in Your Home
Agent's A	Ager				under 42 U.S.C. 4852d and is aware of
	ing partie	es have reviewe ve provided	is true and accur		to the best of their knowledge, that the
Kegi	Ma 1	Glan	Date	Logor	Date
Lessor	Im	iller	4/20/10	Lessor	2 4/20/10
Lessee			Date	EXHIBIT	'Date/
Agent			Date	11EX	Date
] [1		